

English version of: T. Henry, 'Perugia 1502', in ed. V. Garibaldi and F.F. Mancini, *Pintoricchio*, exh. cat., Perugia (Galleria Nazionale) and Spello, 2008, pp. 121-129.

Perugia 1502

This essay will argue, more forcefully than I think it has been argued before, that Raphael's first introduction to Perugia and to Perugian patrons came about as a result of his connection with Pintoricchio. I will argue that from late 1501 until mid 1503, Raphael's principal model and point of contact was Pintoricchio, and that in addition to the works for which he supplied drawings, Raphael also owed his first independent opportunities in Perugia (and, of course, in Siena as well) to his contact with Pintoricchio.

Leaving aside the vexed issue of Raphael's training and activity in the 1490s, my concentration is on his arrival in the city in 1502, or late 1501.¹ The basic facts are very well known. In September 1501 Raphael delivered his first altarpiece, the now fragmentary *Coronation of St Nicholas of Tolentino*, to his major patron in Città di Castello, Andrea Baronci. At least three further commissions followed in this Northern Umbrian city², but it is perfectly possible that none of these was executed in Città di Castello. The evidence suggests that Raphael's focus shifted to Perugia, where he is first documented in January and March 1503 (he was described as living there in January 1504).³ This conclusion is widely accepted and is supported by the stylistic dating and apparent patronage of works contemporaneous with his paintings for Città di Castello, the new intensity of his engagement with Perugian works by Perugino and Pintoricchio, the evidence that he knew some of these works before they were delivered, and the fact that he provided drawings for works by Pintoricchio c.1502-3 (further discussed below). Although Pintoricchio has always been recognised to be part of the equation, the predominant conclusion of scholarship to date has been that Raphael's introduction to Perugia was the result of his proximity to Perugino in this decade (if not in the 1490s as well). This essay argues that Pintoricchio was much more important in Raphael's early success in Perugia than has usually been recognised and – by extension – that Perugino was much less important.⁴

* This essay benefited from the assistance of Donal Cooper, Beverley Lyle, Claudia La Malfa, Rita Silvestrelli, Alberto Sartore and Giorgia Mancini.

¹ Carol Plazzotta and I argued that Raphael trained in Giovanni Santi's workshop in Urbino in Chapman, Henry & Plazzotta 2004-5, pp. 16-18. The traditional argument for an apprenticeship with Perugino in the 1490s has been restated by Mancini 2006 (amongst others). A reframing of that position has been argued by Ferino Pagden 2006. This writer is yet to be persuaded by Ferino's re-attribution of various Perugino drawings to Raphael, and stands by the arguments presented in Chapman, Henry & Plazzotta 2004-5, *loc. cit.*.

² The fullest treatment of Raphael's activity in Città di Castello is Henry 2006. Since that appeared (and taking up some thought-provoking suggestions of Mancini, *art. cit.* in note 1) I have argued in a paper presented at the Raphael conference in New York in June 2006 that a drawing of the *Annunciation* in Stockholm (inv. 291) may have been made in preparation for an unexecuted fifth commission in Città di Castello, namely an altarpiece for the Magalotti chapel in S. Domenico, eventually commissioned from Francesco Tifernate in November 1505.

³ For these documents that establish Raphael's presence in Città di Castello and Perugia see Shearman 2003, pp. 73-82 and Cooper 2004. No other documents establish Raphael's whereabouts in the years 1501-4.

⁴ Parts of the argument for Pintoricchio's importance have been set out by Oberhuber 1977, and Mancini 1987, p. 10 et seq. It is also a strong theme in Crowe & Cavalcaselle 1882-5.

Before turning to the evidence for Raphael's connection with Pintoricchio, it is worth reminding ourselves what was happening in Perugia at the time and what Pintoricchio and Perugino were up to. Instead of bringing peace, the Baglioni dominance of Perugia brought appalling internecine bloodshed. Following the *nozze rosse* of July 1500 the faction led by Giampaolo and Morgante Baglioni dominated Perugia and struck important truces with the Vitelli of Città di Castello, the Duke of Urbino and with Cesare Borgia.⁵ Borgia loyalty was notoriously short-lived, however, and after Giampaolo avoided the trap that had been set for him at Senigallia in December 1502, Cesare/Duke Valentino turned on the Baglioni in January 1503, resulting in their enforced exile from the city from January to September 1503, and the related re-entry of the degli Oddi during this period.

From March 1499 until his near definitive departure for Siena in 1503-4⁶, Pintoricchio was largely to be found in Perugia and nearby. He completed his frescoes for Troilo Baglioni in the Cappella Bella of S. Maria Maggiore, Spello in 1500-1⁷ and was in Siena in June 1502 to sign the contract to paint frescoes in the Libreria Piccolomini.⁸ But apart from these demands on his time he seems to have been predominantly in Perugia and to have been putting down stable roots in the city (developing his property in the parish of S. Fortunato in the Porta Sant'Angelo by building against a neighbouring wall, boring a new well, paying the local hearth tax etc).⁹ While one cannot point to a welter of Perugian commissions, there is a danger of underestimating the significance of those that he did receive; and he might reasonably have been hoping in 1502 that the local dominance of Perugino was on the wane (see further below). Pintoricchio's commission to paint an altarpiece for S. Maria dei Fossi (recently ceded to the Regular Canons of the Augustinians) was a splendid re-entry to the city after his many (very successful) years in Rome; and it also re-animated his important long-standing connection with the Alfani. We do not know when Pintoricchio completed this picture which was commissioned in February 1495. The assumption that it was painted in the course of the following year may well be incorrect given his other commitments in Rome and Orvieto. However, he subsequently received the major commission to paint frescoes for Troilo Baglioni, the new rector of S. Maria Maggiore, Spello; the relatively minor commission to paint the gonfalone of S. Agostino (1499-1500); and, in late 1502, the contract to paint the Assumption altarpiece for the Observant Franciscans of S.M. della Pietà at La Fratta (modern-day Umbertide: the painting seems to have been largely complete by June 1503

⁵ These alliances between Città di Castello and Urbino and Perugia in the first three years of the new century may prove to have been critical in facilitating Raphael's move from the former cities to the latter, especially given that Vitellozzo Vitelli was frequently in Perugia during the first couple of years of the century and he and his family were closely connected to Raphael's circle of influential patrons in Città di Castello, and that Raphael was also well-connected with the Montefeltro.

⁶ The related issues of Pintoricchio's departure from Perugia, and of progress in the Piccolomini library, have not been definitively resolved, but very few of the documents that appear to place Pintoricchio in Perugia in 1503 can be entirely trusted (they could have been made in his absence in most cases) and the Siennese documents suggest that he had made significant progress on his work in the city before the end of the year. In particular it seems that the *Coronation of Pius III* (in the nave of the Cathedral, and presumably not added to the commission until after Pius' election in September 1503) was complete by February 1504 when the scaffold in the nave was removed (see Oberhuber 1986, p. 170, note 15).

⁷ For these frescoes and their dating, see Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, pp. 214-20.

⁸ Milanese 1856, III, pp. 9-16.

⁹ For these references see Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, pp. 289-90.

and the contract suggests that it was to be worked on in Umbertide over a four month period in early 1503).¹⁰ In sum, he had painted a revolutionary church altarpiece; frescoed a major Baglioni chapel when the family's star was at its highest; taken on commissions from the Augustinians and Franciscans; and renewed contacts with the Alfani family. His civic profile was confirmed when he served as a Prior in March and April 1501 and one can document his prominent support from Rome in the period (Cesare Borgia's letters in his favour are discussed below). It may also prove relevant that Pintoricchio was dangerously ill in September 1502. In the will that he made – *corpore languens* – at this time, Pintoricchio put his affairs in order and it is not beyond the bounds of probability that his 'succession planning' extended to thinking who might assume his place in the artistic scene in Perugia when he left for Siena or a better place.¹¹

Perugino is usually and rightly seen to have presided over the dominant local workshop in Perugia and his perceived stranglehold on local patronage has been described both as the reason that Pintoricchio did not receive more local commissions,¹² and as the specific spur to local artists banding together in competition.¹³ These conclusions may be correct but it is also worth noting that Perugino largely turned his back on Perugia in the years 1503-7.¹⁴ In the period between September 1502 and June 1507 he only received one new commission in the city that we know of (the pala Martinelli for S. Francesco al Prato, which was not delivered until 1518)¹⁵ and he is largely to be found in Florence between these dates. He left Perugia before the end of September 1502 and the only dates on which Perugino was certainly to be found in Perugia in 1503 was on 23 November, when he was paid for painting papal coats of arms in the city (a task that was almost certainly executed in his absence and by his shop). He was there again in late February/early March 1504, and during the same months in 1505.¹⁶ If Pintoricchio (or Raphael), was looking at the artistic situation in Perugia in these years, they could be forgiven for reaching the conclusion that Perugino's hegemony could finally be broken (as indeed it was, but by Raphael not Pintoricchio, who received five altarpiece commissions in Perugia c.1502-5 while Perugino received only one which was not delivered until thirteen years later).¹⁷

Moreover, a comparison of Pintoricchio's and Raphael's Perugian patrons, supporters and contacts – the Baglioni and Alfani, as well as the nuns of Monteluca, Venciolo di Sacramore, the notary Giacomo di Cristofano 'Zoppo', and possibly Francesco degli Oddi – shows how Pintoricchio's work in the city and his connections at the papal court had garnered Pintoricchio powerful friends, and that many of these patrons and supporters subsequently showed favour to Raphael, suggesting – I argue –

¹⁰ See Silvestrelli 2005.

¹¹ A comparable example of an artist making these kind of plans at this kind of time is provided by Luca Signorelli who gifted his workshop in Cortona to Vincenzo di Pier Paolo Michelangelo on the same day in 1502 on which he made his first will, see the discussion of this example in Henry 1999, p. 224.

¹² Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, pp. 207-11.

¹³ Mancini 2004 and Mancini 1995.

¹⁴ Perugino had, however, received important commissions in the first two and a half years of the century, rented a new workshop from January 1501, and served as prior in the same period, whilst simultaneously completing the decoration of the Cambio, the *Sposalizio* for the Cathedral, and the *S. Anna* now in Marseilles; see Scarpellini 1984, p. 65 and the further documentation in Canuti 1931.

¹⁵ For which, see Sartore 2004.

¹⁶ As well, perhaps as the period June-September 1504, see Canuti 1931, II, pp. 199, 192, 203 *et passim*.

¹⁷ Chapman, Henry & Plazzotta 2004-5, pp. 31-33.

that Pintoricchio may have acted as a springboard for the young artist's launch in Perugia.

Pintoricchio's Baglioni connections are most clearly evidenced by his activity in the Cappella Bella at Spello but it is also worth noting that he benefitted from prominent support in his civic dealings at the moment when he was: a/ working in Spello for Troilo Baglioni in S. Maria Maggiore; and b/ when the Baglioni state was most closely aligned with Cesare Borgia (indeed in his letters, Duke Valentino emphasised that Pintoricchio was to be favoured because he had recently undertaken new work for the Borgia).¹⁸ And when Giampaolo Baglioni had to flee Perugia in January 1503 (as Cesare Borgia now advanced against him), he sought refuge in Siena, where his connections with Pandolfo Petrucci may well have resulted in Pintoricchio's later commission to work on the Camera Bella of the Petrucci Palace. Pintoricchio memorably alluded to this in his altarpiece at Spello by including a letter written to him in April 1508 by Bishop Gentile Baglioni asking that the artist return to Siena at once to complete work undertaken for Pandolfo Petrucci.¹⁹ Raphael's connections with the Baglioni date from the end of his period of activity in Perugia; but Francesco Mancini has nevertheless characterised him as the "pittore ufficiale" of the "Stato Baglionesco", pointing to the potential roles of Ilaria and Leandra Baglioni in Raphael's altarpiece commissions for the convent of S. Antonio da Padova and for the degli Oddi altar in S. Francesco al Prato.²⁰ (Although this has also been challenged by Donal Cooper, who makes the fair point that the tangled web of family alliances is so complicated in this period that one needs to demonstrate very direct lines in order to successfully link Troilo Baglioni with Madonna Atalanta and the commission of the Borghese *Entombment*.²¹)

Pintoricchio had a long-standing connection with the Alfani, having worked for Suor Battista and Suor Eufrosia Alfani at Monteluce in the 1480s and apparently designed an astrolabe (now in the Museum für Kunst und Gewerbe, Hamburg) for Alfano di Diamante Alfani (c.1465–1550) in 1498.²² Alfano Alfani was papal treasurer of Perugia for almost 40 years from August 1492 (when he was appointed to stand in for the Sienese banker, Giulio Spannocchi)²³ and seems to have had a finger in every pie, especially those with an artistic flavour.²⁴ He witnessed Pintoricchio's contract to paint the S.M. dei Fossi altarpiece in February 1495 (the notarial act was drawn up in the Fondaco Alfani)²⁵ and in the summer of 1502 he stood as Pintoricchio's guarantor and handled the initial advance of 300 ducats that Pintoricchio received upon signing the Piccolomini library contract.²⁶ His strong Sienese connections at the Borgia court may have encouraged him to support Pintoricchio's reintegration into Perugian life (Cesare Borgia wrote directly to Alfani on 14 October 1500 regarding a subsidy for the well that

¹⁸ Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, docs. 100 and 101 (14 and 20 October 1500), p. 289.

¹⁹ See Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, doc. 188, p. 292.

²⁰ Mancini 1987, pp. 24, 41-47, 54-55.

²¹ See Cooper forthcoming.

²² Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, pp. 98, 130.

²³ See Morandi 1978, p. 112. See also A. Stella in *Dizionario Biografico degli Italiani*, 2, Rome, 1960, p. 249.

²⁴ Alfani was, for instance, also involved at numerous points in Perugino's career, see Canuti 1931, II, pp. 180, 181, 187, 198, 201, 300, 304. His connection with Raphael is evidenced below.

²⁵ See Vermiglioli 1837, doc. 2, pp. IV-VII.

²⁶ Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, p. 289.

Pintoricchio wanted to dig in Perugia)²⁷ and in addition helped to facilitate his subsequent Piccolomini and Petrucci commissions in Siena. Alfani was also related to the Baglioni by marriage to Marietta di Mariotto Baglioni.²⁸ Raphael also had a demonstrably close connection with Alfano Alfani. The *Conestabile Madonna* in St Petersburg (Hermitage) was probably commissioned by him, and certainly belonged to the Alfani by 1600. Alfano Alfani witnessed the 1516 renewal of Raphael's altarpiece contract with the nuns of Monteluca,²⁹ a commission in which his aunt, Antonia, herself a patron of Pintoricchio's (who entered the Monteluca convent as Suor Battista) had been the moving force in December 1505.³⁰

While Alfani's importance has often been commented upon, the role played by other parties named in the Piccolomini Library documents have not been fully investigated. The most important of these seems to be Francesco Oddi (/degli Oddi?), a merchant who acted as Depositorio of Perugia, 1500-3 and is named in the three Perugian documents regarding this commission.³¹ Frustratingly, his patronymic and the article (degli) is never given. I had hoped to identify him as Francesco di Leone di Guido degli Oddi.³² Guido, who died in 1461, was one of the key figures in the degli Oddi genealogy. Cooper has demonstrated how he obtained the original assignment of the chapel of the Madonna in the church of S. Francesco al Prato and how the testamentary bequests of a number of his children and grandchildren (including Francesco's sister Maddalena) financed the refurbishment of the chapel in the early sixteenth century.³³ Unfortunately, this cannot be proved, and Beverley Lyle has suggested that he might in fact be a member of the Novelli branch of the family as he is described as a resident of the Porta Sant'Angelo (while the majority of the degli Oddi proper lived in the Porta Santa Susanna and Porta Eburnea).³⁴ Without some further clarification it will not be possible to investigate a possible link with Raphael's degli Oddi altarpiece; but the prominence of Francesco [degli] Oddi in the first few years of the sixteenth century warrants investigation and if he can be identified as Maddalena's brother then his civic

²⁷ Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, p. 289. See also Mancini 2000.

²⁸ Marietta, apart from her Baglioni connections, had a sister in the convent at Monteluca (Suor Bonifazia) and a brother Fra Evangelista who was provincial vicar of the Observants on more than one occasion in the late fifteenth century.

²⁹ Shearman 2003, pp. 253-57.

³⁰ Shearman 2003, pp. 86-92 and the *Cronaca di Monteluca* in the same collection, pp. 93-6.

³¹ See Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, docs 120, 124, 126, pp. 289-90 (and doc. 148 on p. 291): ASP Notarile, Paolo di Simone di Antonio, 1495-1504, Bast 506 (formerly 913), fol. 385 r (6.6.1502); Giacomo di Cristoforo di Giacomo (detto lo Zoppo), Prot 432, fol. 678 r-v (12.8.1502); Berardino di Angelo di Antonio, 1491-1502, Bast 807 (formerly 650), fol. 512v-513v (1.9.1502). In these he is consistently described as 'Nobilis Vir/os'. Kate Lowe has kindly informed me that Francesco degli Oddi was apparently married to Lucrezia di Giovanni di Baldino (dei Baldini), sister of the abbess of Monteluca in 1500 (Lorenza di Giovanni).

³² See degli Oddi 1904, p. 57.

³³ See Cooper 2001, Cooper 2004, and the subsequent correction published as a letter in *The Burlington Magazine*, CXLVIII (2006), p. 779.

³⁴ Personal communication in June 2007, with reference to Grohmann 1981, pp. 533-4 having a Francesco son of Oddo from the Novelli branch living in the Porta Sant'Angelo. This conclusion is probably confirmed by a communication from Rita Silvestrelli received in November 2007 which suggests that he should be identified as Francesco di Oddo di Giacomo from the Porta Sant'Angelo, a merchant with a shop on the Piazza. I am grateful to Beverley Lyle and Rita Silvestrelli for their help in this.

prominence and his connection with Pintoricchio in 1502 could prove important to understanding how Raphael received the degli Oddi commission.

Yet another character who seems to have played a prominent role for both Pintoricchio and Raphael was Venciolo di Sacramorre. A neighbour of Pintoricchio's, who stood as his guarantor on several occasions (e.g. when Pintoricchio received his first advance from Cardinal Piccolomini), Venciolo was named as the executor of Pintoricchio's will in September 1502.³⁵ In December 1505 he acted as guarantor for Raphael and Berto di Giovanni in the contract for the Monteluca *Coronation of the Virgin* and his daughter later entered the convent.³⁶ Pintoricchio also had longstanding connections with the convent at Monteluca (he worked for it in the 1480s when Suor Eufrosia Alfani (d.1489) was particularly prominent in its administration)³⁷ and many of these connections were still relevant in the first few years of the sixteenth century when, as abbess, Suor Battista (Alfani, d.1523) sought opinions on who was the best artist in Perugia at the time before awarding the commission to Raphael (and Berto di Giovanni).³⁸

Frequently linking these individuals and institutions was a notary, Giacomo di Cristofano 'Zoppo', whose importance was first noted by Mancini, and whose activities still deserve further detailed analysis.³⁹ In addition to his previously noted role with Franciscan institutions (including drawing up the often cited Monteluca contract of 1505), it is striking that he made numerous acts for the Baglioni, the Alfani, and the degli Oddi and was clearly intimately involved in Pintoricchio's affairs – drawing up his will in September 1502 as well as six other documents for the artist between July 1501 and February 1503.⁴⁰ Raphael's connection with this notary also predated the Monteluca contract of December 1505 and included the earliest document for his presence in Perugia – the act relating to Battista di Andrea's mule where Raphael (as the principal contracting party) is likely to have chosen the notary.⁴¹

This circle was largely closed to Perugino. He had worked for them in the late 1470s but there seems to be very little contact thereafter. Alfano Alfani crops up in some documents for Perugino (indeed his civic role was such that he crops up almost everywhere) but a careful analysis of the documents for this phase of Perugino's career demonstrates that the artist had no real entry to the same circles as Pintoricchio. And, as Scarpellini has noted, it may be that Perugino's concentration on Florence in the years 1503-7 may have started as a reaction to the instability and changing political allegiances of these years and subsequently continued owing to Raphael's success at exploiting his absence (a success that I would argue stemmed from the introductions he received via Pintoricchio before the latter's departure for Siena).

³⁵ Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, docs 120, 124 and 128, pp. 289-90.

³⁶ Shearman 2003, pp. 86-92.

³⁷ Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, docs 23-26 and 29.

³⁸ See Shearman 2003, p. 93 (29.12.1505 '*... ma fece trovare el maestro el migliore li fusse consigliata da più cittadini et ancho da li nostri venerandi patri ...*').

³⁹ See Mancini 1987, p. 36, where he is identified as 'il notaio "ufficiale" dei conventi e dei monasteri dell'ordine francescano'.

⁴⁰ For these see ASP Notarile, Giacomo di Cristoforo di Giacomo (detto lo Zoppo), Prot 431, fols. 45r-47v Prot 432, fols. 661r-662r, 678 r-v, 780v-782r, 899r-902v, 1186v-1188r; Prot 433, fols. 81v-82r: see Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, docs. 110, 123-4, 128, 138, 144, 146, pp. 289-291.

⁴¹ See now Shearman 2003, pp. 79-80 and 86-92.

This argument can be developed with reference to a number of well-known drawings. The first of these is the verso of a sheet made in preparation for the processional banner that Raphael painted for the confraternity of the Holy Trinity at Città di Castello (P II, 501; fig. 1). As I have argued elsewhere the extraordinary experience of seeing this banner in London in 2004-5 and in the company of the *Mond Crucifixion* (1502-3), fragments from the *Coronation of St Nicholas* (1500-1) and related drawings, convinced this writer that the Città di Castello banner must have been painted after the *Coronation* and before or alongside the *Mond Crucifixion*.⁴² The importance of dating this banner to the period 1502-3 or even to 1502 for the argument that follows lies in the connection with Pintoricchio of the verso of this drawing. In addition to an autograph inscription, and a study of a building, the sheet has some jotted sketches of the Virgin and Child with the young St John. The most resolved of these shows St John supporting Jesus who sits sideways on a pack saddle, while the Virgin Mary kneels before him in prayer.⁴³ The motif is developed in two other drawings in the Ashmolean (P II, nos. 502 and 40, figs. 2 and 3; the latter dispensing with St John and introducing St Joseph and two shepherds).⁴⁴ The attribution to Raphael of the principal drawing under discussion is not in question – it is inscribed in his hand and has a drawing for the Città di Castello banner on its recto – but the other two drawings have been more controversial. The earlier study is slight, but lively and has recently been accepted by Parker, Gere and Turner, Joannides, Knab, Mitsch and Oberhuber.⁴⁵ The finished small cartoon (fig. 3) was given to Pintoricchio by Morelli, and later by Parker; while Fischel, Turner and Gere, Knab, Mitsch and Oberhuber eventually accepted the attribution to Raphael (a view shared by this writer, not least because the drawing bears so little resemblance to the few autograph sheets by Pintoricchio).⁴⁶ This debate will not end until Pintoricchio's corpus of drawings has been better defined, but I would like to propose here that these studies were probably made by Raphael for the predella of Pintoricchio's Umbertide *Coronation* in late 1502 or early 1503.⁴⁷ This picture (now in the Musei Vaticani, fig. 6) was commissioned from Pintoricchio in December 1502 by agents acting for the observant Franciscans of S. Maria della Pietà at Fratta (modern-day Umbertide, 30 kilometres North of Perugia).⁴⁸ Despite the connection of aspects of the picture with the degli Oddi *Coronation* (fig. 7, further discussed below), no one had suggested that Raphael had been involved with

⁴² See Chapman, Henry & Plazzotta 2004-5, and the further comments in Henry 2006, pp. 46-48.

⁴³ See Robinson 1870, pp. 114-15, Parker 1956, II, no. 501, pp. 252-3, Joannides 1983, pp. 36-37, and Chapman, Henry & Plazzotta 2004-5, pp. 106-7.

⁴⁴ Apart from J.C. Robinson, this is also discussed by Crowe & Cavalcaselle 1882-5, I, pp. 114-17.

⁴⁵ See Parker 1956, II, no. 502, p. 253, Gere & Turner 1983, no. 6, pp. 25-6, Joannides 1983, no. 12, p. 36, Knab, Mitsch & Oberhuber 1984, no. 7, p. 581.

⁴⁶ See Parker 1956, II, no. 40, pp. 25-6 (with previous bibliography), Gere & Turner 1983, no. 7, pp. 26-7, Knab, Mitsch & Oberhuber 1984, no. 8, p. 581.

⁴⁷ The only other possibility for a predella with this subject at about this time is Pintoricchio's lost Sergardi *Nativity* altarpiece for the church of S. Francesco in Siena, for which Raphael is said to have painted the predella (see Shearman 2003, pp. 77-79, although the 1502-3 dating is Shearman's speculation).

⁴⁸ See Silvestrelli 2005, Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, docs. 143, 147, 151, 162 and 163, pp. 290-91, and Rossi 1890. I am very grateful to Rita Silvestrelli for sending me unpublished documents relating to this commission.

Pintoricchio's altarpiece in any way until Konrad Oberhuber recognised two kneeling saints in the Musée du Louvre, Paris (Cats. 22 and 23 and fig. 8) as preparatory for the picture. Despite the doubts voiced elsewhere in this catalogue by Claudia La Malfa, I find Oberhuber's attribution entirely convincing.⁴⁹ The metalpoint and white heightening of the rectos are comparable to Raphael's studies for the São Paulo *Resurrection* and the drawing in pen and ink on the versos (fig. 8 crucially includes one of the shield-bearing putti for the Piccolomini Library which can be compared with a similar figure on the verso of Ashmolean P II, 510), especially the slight studies of a *Presentation in the Temple*, are exactly comparable with the studies for the Virgin and Child and St John on Ashmolean P II 501 (fig. 1). Thanks to the discovery of the December 1502 contract for the Umbertide altarpiece by Rita Silvestrelli we now know that '... *in predule pingeat Nativitatis domini Nostri Jesu Christi et alios santos ad beneplacitum dominorum procuratorum*', and it seems highly probable that the *Adoration* studied in these three drawings in the Ashmolean formed one part of a Nativity predella, possibly with other episodes such as the Annunciation and the Presentation in the Temple (the latter perhaps based on the design on the verso of one of the drawings in the Louvre).⁵⁰ What is certain is that the motif of the pack saddle on the ground is predominantly found in the orbit of Pintoricchio (Pintoricchio places a saddle prominently in his *Adoration of the Shepherds* of 1500-1 at Spello, although it is distanced from the Holy Family, and it subsequently reappears in Pacchiarotto's *Adoration* in Siena⁵¹) and never in that of Perugino. Its appearance on three closely related occasions at this point in Raphael's career is thus of great interest, especially given how Pintoricchiesque the Virgin is in Ashmolean P II 40. When one adds this to the other evidence for Raphael's association with Pintoricchio it seems reasonable to suggest that the motif was developed by Raphael during the period of closest contact, and hence to suggest that this probably occurred in Perugia in 1502. If Raphael was initiating this contact at the time that he was completing the *Coronation of St Nicholas* (it was delivered in September 1501), then some interesting proposals of Pietro Scarpellini should be borne in mind.⁵² Scarpellini noted the Raphaelesque character of the singing angels in the *Adoration of the Shepherds* at Spello, and some parallels with Raphael's *Angel* at Brescia (Cat. 68, a fragment of the *Coronation of St Nicholas*). These parallels suggest to me that Raphael knew these frescoes and had probably already prepared the ground for the collaborations that followed. Certainly Raphael's immediately subsequent work is deeply indebted to Pintoricchio. The São Paulo *Resurrection*, for example, shows every sign of being designed and executed (I believe by the same artist, namely the young Raphael) at exactly this moment (1501-2) and with the determined influence of Pintoricchio at its back.⁵³ As do two slightly later works: the

⁴⁹ See Oberhuber 1977, pp. 79-80, and C. La Malfa in this catalogue, pp. 362-3.

⁵⁰ This study has previously been identified as an early study for the *Presentation* in the predella of the degli Oddi *Coronation*, for which see Oberhuber 1977, p. 80, and Cordellier & Py 1992, pp. 13-19.

⁵¹ Saddles first appear on the ground in Umbrian art in Fra Filippo Lippi's hugely influential frescoes at Spoleto, which had an immediate impact on Fra Diamante (*Adoration* in the Louvre, Paris) and also influenced Benedetto Bonfigli (*Adoration of the Magi* in the Galleria Nazionale, Perugia). The motif seems not to reappear in Umbrian art between 1466 (Bonfigli) and 1501 (Spello). The Siennese tradition differs, however.

⁵² Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, p. 215.

⁵³ The argument for the *Resurrection* has been most forcefully presented by Carol Plazzotta in Chapman, Henry & Plazzotta 2004-5, pp. 108-111.

Virgin and Child with Saints Francis and Jerome in Berlin and the *Saint Sebastian* in Bergamo, paintings which can probably be dated 1502.⁵⁴

The history of Raphael's subsequent collaboration with Pintoricchio in Siena is well-known, even if the exact date remains at issue, but how does the picture change if we recognise a much earlier connection with Pintoricchio? To this writer if we identify close contact in the period when Raphael was completing his first altarpiece for Città di Castello and undertaking the Trinity banner for that city, and if we see this continuing into Pintoricchio's designs for the Umbertide altarpiece and Siena frescoes, then it looks as though the collaboration was extensive and precisely coincided with Raphael's move to Perugia, bolstering the argument that his introduction to the city depended more upon his connection with Pintoricchio than Perugino.

It does not come as any particular surprise to discover that the scholars who adopted a position closest to that outlined above were Crowe and Cavalcaselle. In addition to describing Pintoricchio as "suo [Raphael] secondo maestro", they had some particularly astute comments to make regarding the degli Oddi *Coronation*.⁵⁵ They noted (unlike most subsequent commentators who have been keen to link the work with Perugino's influence) the Pintoricchiesque character and disposition of the picture, and they even allowed for the possibility that it might have been commissioned from one artist – by implication Pintoricchio or their rather improbable suggestion of Pintoricchio and Perugino – and subsequently painted by the younger master.⁵⁶ In the light of the preceding argument this is a tempting proposition, and it also encourages a re-examination of the preparatory drawings, and in particular the early compositional studies (or copies thereof) in Budapest and Paris (figs. 9 and 10).⁵⁷ The former is the most obviously Pintoricchiesque in design (indeed van Marle gave the drawing to Pintoricchio in 1933), but I can find nothing comparable in Pintoricchio's graphic corpus, and the delicacy and movement seem entirely characteristic of Raphael. The latter is damaged and presents some problems, but at the very least seems to record a preliminary design for the lower part of the degli Oddi *Coronation*. Pintoricchio painted the Assumption several times in the course of his career, and was faithful to the traditional iconography of the standing Virgin in a mandorla until 1503. The iconography of the degli Oddi *Coronation of the Virgin* has been discussed at length by Sylvia Ferino and others, on the basis that 1/ it was originally commissioned as an Assumption, and 2/ that Raphael developed the iconographic change by rejecting the solution in his Budapest drawing in favour of a Coronation.⁵⁸ This is apparently confirmed by the case of Pintoricchio's Umbertide *Coronation* which was demonstrably commissioned as an Assumption (see below), and which – like the degli Oddi picture – was delivered as a Coronation (albeit markedly different from Raphael's solution in the top part of the picture, although, like

⁵⁴ For these see T. Henry in Chapman, Henry & Plazzotta 2004-5, pp. 116-119.

⁵⁵ Crowe & Cavalcaselle 1882-5 (2 vols), pp. 136-7.

⁵⁶ Crowe & Cavalcaselle 1882-5, I, pp. 141-2, 150.

⁵⁷ The former is in the Szépművészeti Museum, Budapest inv. 1779; the latter is in the Musée du Louvre, Paris, no. inv. 3970 (for which see Cordellier & Py 1992, pp. 24-5, no. 17 [as 'copie fidèle et précoce' of Raphael's original]).

⁵⁸ Ferino Pagden 1986 – the drawings are discussed on pp. 17-18.

the foreground saints, the figures of God the Father and the Virgin Mary may also have been designed by Raphael).⁵⁹

If we accept the Budapest drawing, its relationship to the Paris drawing, and that the latter is either an original or an early copy, how does their connection with both the Umbertide and degli Oddi *Coronations* affect this discussion? While I am convinced that they are connected, it must be admitted that the only figure who really supports such a conclusion is the St Thomas (?), second from the left in the drawing and the paintings. Even this figure could be said to be no more than a development from Raphael's left-hand angel in the *Coronation of St Nicolas* of 1500-1, and the connection is not precise. Nevertheless, I suspect that the painted versions both developed from the drawing. This supports the conclusion that Raphael started to design the degli Oddi *Coronation* at this point of close collaboration with Pintoricchio and that these studies (and separate studies specifically for the latter) fed into Pintoricchio's contemporaneous Umbertide *Coronation* – albeit that they were then varied, and flattened and rendered less intelligent by the older artist and his standard collaborators.

In addition to the evidence for the contact between Raphael and Pintoricchio in 1502, and Raphael's involvement in the design of the Umbertide *Coronation*, the disposition and attitudes of the figures in Pintoricchio's picture suggest – as Scarpellini noted – that it was designed with knowledge of the degli Oddi *Coronation* and the relationship between the two pictures is crucial and could be thought to reinforce Crowe and Cavalcaselle's proposition that the degli Oddi commission might have come to Raphael via Pintoricchio.

Commissioned on 17 December 1502, the Umbertide *Coronation* (which was commissioned as an '*Assumptionem Beate Marie Virginis cum apostolis et aliis ornamentis*') was to be executed by late April 1503 for a total price of 100 ducats. The painter received 10 of these at the point of commission. He received a further advance on 13 February 1503 (presumably the balance of the advance that he had been promised at the outset of the commission, and perhaps signalling that he had recently arrived in Fratta to paint the picture *in situ* – again as anticipated by the contract). Pintoricchio received a further 60 florins on 27 June 1503, almost certainly on delivery of the finished picture (for all that a further 12 ducats were paid in October 1505).⁶⁰ In other words, Pintoricchio and his team designed and painted the picture between 17 December 1502 and 27 June 1503. It is furthermore of interest that the effective patrons were from Perugia (the altarpiece was paid for by Alessandra di Costanzo (Nutri Cecchi), the widow of Giovanni di Tommaso Cechi da Perugia, Porta Sole). It would be useful to discover more about these patrons and their links with Perugia, Umbertide, the Franciscans, Pintoricchio and perhaps the degli Oddi (who, it should be noted, spent much of the 1490s based in

⁵⁹ The argument that God the Father and the Virgin Mary were also designed by Raphael was proposed by Oberhuber and adopted by Scarpellini in Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, pp. 226-30, esp. p. 227. Another drawing that should also be considered in this connection is the *Kneeling Youth* in the Ashmolean, P II 509 (for which see *inter alia* Chapman, Henry & Plazzotta 2004-5, p. 125), which may well have been Raphael's idea for the figure of St Francis in Pintoricchio's picture. It is more sophisticated than the two saints in the Louvre, figs. 4 and 5, but not more advanced than the drawings for the degli Oddi *Coronation* which I argue below to have been contemporaneous. There is more work to do, both on the connection between these two pictures and the development of the iconography.

⁶⁰ See Silvestrelli 2005, Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004, docs. 143, 147, 151, 162 and 163, pp. 290-91, and Rossi 1890.

Umbertide during their exile from Perugia).⁶¹ It would also help to discover the predella of this altarpiece in order to establish whether the hypothesis proposed here – that Raphael designed elements of this altarpiece at the point of his closest connection with Pintoricchio – finds any support.⁶² But for now, the most probable conclusion is that Raphael owed his introduction to Perugia in 1502 to Bernardino di Betto, il Pintoricchio.

Tom Henry

⁶¹ Cronache Perugine (attributed to Francesco Matarazzo), *Archivio Storico Italiano*, XVI.2 (1851), pp. 40, 59 *et passim*.

⁶² See Silvestrelli 2005 for the evidence that the predella survived until the mid-nineteenth century and had portraits of the patroness and her son as well as Nativity scenes. It should be noted that a weak painted version of Raphael's cartoon (fig. 3) is recorded in a photograph in the Ruland corpus and as then in the Conestabile collection in Perugia (with an apparent provenance from the 'Anjafani' family).

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Canuti 1931 = F. Canuti, *Il Perugino*, Siena, 1931.
- Chapman, Henry & Plazzotta 2004-5 = ed. H. Chapman, T. Henry, C. Plazzotta, *Raphael: from Urbino to Rome*, exh. cat., London (National Gallery), 2004-5.
- Cooper 2001 = D. Cooper, 'Raphael's altar-pieces in S. Francesco al Prato, Perugia: patronage, setting and function', *The Burlington Magazine*, CXLIII (2001), pp. 554-561.
- Cooper 2004 = D. Cooper, 'New documents for Raphael and his patrons in Perugia', *The Burlington Magazine*, CXLVI (2004), pp. 742-44.
- Cooper forthcoming = D. Cooper, 'La commissione di Atalanta Baglioni e la collocazione originaria della *Deposizione* nella chiesa di San Francesco al Prato', in ed. K. Hermann-Fiore, *Raffaello. La Pala Baglioni*, Rome 2008 (forthcoming).
- Cordellier & Py 1992 = D. Cordellier and B. Py, *Raphaël: son atelier, ses copistes. Inventaire général des dessins italiens*, Paris, 1992.
- Crowe & Cavalcaselle 1882-5 = J.A. Crowe and G.B. Cavalcaselle, *Raphael: His Life and Works*, London, 1882-5.
- Degli Oddi 1904 = F. degli Oddi, *Note illustrative all'albero genealogico degli Oddi, famiglia nobile e patrizia di Perugia e Ferrara*, Perugia, 1904.
- Ferino Pagden 1986 = S. Ferino Pagden, 'Iconographic demands and artistic achievements: the genesis of three works by Raphael', in ed. C.L. Frommel and M. Winner, *Raffaello a Roma*, Rome, 1986, pp. 13-27.
- Ferino Pagden 2006 = S. Ferino Pagden in 'Raffaello: gli anni della formazione, ovvero quando si manifesta il genio?', in ed. A. Coliva, *Raffaello: da Firenze a Roma*, exh. cat., Rome (Galleria Borghese), 2006, pp. 20-33.
- Gere & Turner 1983 = J.A. Gere and N. Turner, *Drawings by Raphael from the Royal Library, the Ashmolean, the British Museum, Chatsworth and other English Collections*, exh. cat., London (British Museum), 1983.
- Grohmann 1981 = A. Grohmann, *Città e territorio tra medioevo ed età moderna*, I, Perugia, 1981.
- Henry 1999 = T. Henry, 'Nuovi documenti su Giovanni Santi', in ed. R. Varese, *Giovanni Santi, Atti del convegno, Urbino, Convento di Santa Chiara, 17-19 March 1995*, Milan, 1999, pp. 223-6.
- Henry 2006 = T. Henry, 'Raphael's patrons in Città di Castello' / 'I committenti di Raffaello a Città di Castello' in ed. T. Henry & F.F. Mancini, *Gli esordi di Raffaello tra Urbino, Città di Castello e Perugia*, exh. cat., Città di Castello (Pinacoteca), 2006, pp. 25-69.
- Joannides 1983 = P. Joannides, *The Drawings of Raphael with a Complete Catalogue*, Los Angeles and Oxford, 1983.
- Knab, Mitsch & Oberhuber 1984 = E. Knab, E. Mitsch, K. Oberhuber, *Raffaello, I Disegni*, Florence, 1984 (first published as *Raphael: Die Zeichnungen*, Munich, 1983).
- Mancini 1987 = F.F. Mancini, *Raffaello in Umbria: cronologia e committenza, nuovi studi e documenti*, Perugia, 1987.
- Mancini 1995 = F.F. Mancini, 'Un episodio di normale 'routine': l'affresco cinquecentesco dell'Oratorio di Sant'Agostino a Perugia', *Commentari d'Arte*, I, 1995, pp. 29-48.

- Mancini 2000 = F.F. Mancini, 'Pinturicchio e il polittico', *L'arte nella storia. Contributi di critica e storia dell'arte per Gianni Carlo Sciolla*, Milan, 2000, pp. 226-227.
- Mancini 2004 = F.F. Mancini, 'Considerazioni sulla bottega umbra del Perugino', in ed. L. Teza, *Pietro Vannucci detto il Perugino. Atti del Convegno internazionale di studio, 25-28 ottobre 2000*, Perugia, 2004, pp. 329-34.
- Mancini 2006 = F.F. Mancini, 'More on the young Raphael: some thoughts on the subject' / 'Ancora su Raffaello giovane: alcune considerazioni in merito' in ed. T. Henry & F.F. Mancini, *Gli esordi di Raffaello tra Urbino, Città di Castello e Perugia*, exh. cat., Città di Castello (Pinacoteca), 2006, pp. 11-24.
- Milanesi 1856 = G. Milanesi, *Documenti per la storia dell'arte senese*, Siena, 1856.
- Morandi 1978 = U. Morandi, 'Gli Spannochchi: piccoli proprietari terrieri, artigiani, piccoli, medi e grandi mercanti-banchieri', in *Studi in onore di Federico Melis*, 5 vols, Naples, 1978, vol 3, pp. 91-120.
- Oberhuber 1977 = K. Oberhuber, 'The Colonna altarpiece in the Metropolitan Museum and Problems of the early style of Raphael', *Metropolitan Museum Journal*, 12 (1977), pp. 51-91, esp. pp. 79-80.
- Oberhuber 1986 = K. Oberhuber, 'Raphael and Pinturicchio', in *Raphael before Rome, Studies in the History of Art*, 17 (1986), pp. 155-72.
- Parker 1956 = K.T. Parker, *Catalogue of the Collection of Drawings in the Ashmolean Museum, vol. II. The Italian Schools*, Oxford, 1956.
- Robinson 1870 = J.C. Robinson, *A Critical Account of the Drawings by Michel Angelo and Raffaello in the University Galleries, Oxford*, Oxford, 1870.
- Rossi 1890 = A. Rossi, 'Nuovi Documenti - Bernardino Pinturicchio', *Archivio storico dell'Arte*, III (1890), pp. 465-66.
- Sartore 2004 = A.M. Sartore, 'Nuovi documenti su alcune committenze a Perugino', in ed. V. Garibaldi and F.F. Mancini, *Perugino. Il Divin Pittore*, exh. cat., Perugia (Galleria Nazionale), 2004, pp. 603-6.
- Scarpellini & Silvestrelli 2004 = P. Scarpellini and M.R. Silvestrelli, *Pinturicchio*, Milan, 2004.
- Scarpellini 1984 = P. Scarpellini, *Perugino*, Milan, 1984.
- Shearman 2003 = J. Shearman, *Raphael in Early Modern Sources - 1483-1602*, New Haven and London, 2003.
- Silvestrelli 2005 = M.R. Silvestrelli, 'Pinturicchio. Il contratto della pala della Fratta e altre committenze Perugine', *I Lunedì della Galleria*, 8 (2005), pp. 63-72.
- Vermiglioli 1837 = G.B. Vermiglioli, *Memorie di Bernardino Pinturicchio, pittore perugino*, Perugia, 1837.